

Aquinnah Planning Board Plan Review Committee Meeting – February 7, 2023

Present: Jim Wallen, Sarah Thulin, Tom Murphy, Heidi Vanderhoop, Jim Mahoney, Isaac Taylor

Not Present: Amara Ignacio, Jim Newman

Also present: Chana Haouzi, Kathryn Robinson, Phil Reegan, Adrian Higgins, Greg Whiting*, Laura Jorden*, Richard Wagner*, Dr Phil Feldberg*, Gabrielle Whitcombe*, Jay Bodnar, Delmont Araujo, Reid Silva, Mark, Chris Alley*, Mark*, Ruth Folchman*, Lisa Rappaport*, Jen Hammerslough*, Eileen Sullivan*, Richard Kais*, Megan Ottens*, Lisa & Darren Friedman*, Ezra Palmer*, Ariana Feldberg*, Meg Higgins*, Kris Horiuchi, Ray Bilodeau

*Meeting was both virtual via Zoom (*attended via zoom) and in person*

Meeting opened at 6:35pm.

Minutes: Tom motioned to accept the 1/3/23 minutes; Sarah seconded; PBPRC voted 5-0, motion passed.

Isaac joined the meeting.

Other Business: Sarah informed the committee of a recent request before the Conservation Commission (Con Com): first house on Sunset Lane (located along State Road), owner Moskowitz, has been in communication with the Tree Warden concerning a tree trimming proposal to open a view easement on their property (section along State Road) for their neighbors across the road; it is Con Coms opinion that the Tree Warden will review the proposal in detail and allow minimal cutting; PBPRC did not express any initial concerns.

Public Hearing: Hugh and Jeanne Taylor of 18 Lighthouse Road Map 6 Lot 32 (continued from 10.18.22, 11.22.22 & 1.3.23) – Isaac recused himself. Special Permit request was re-advertised for this hearing given the recent development of an expanded leaching field (special permit required for siting of septic and any ground disturbance in the Cliffs DCPC). MVC closed their hearing of the application on Feb 2nd, written record will close on Feb 16th and after that there will be a post hearing with MVC Land Use Planning Committee. Hopefully MVC will have a final decision mid-March. Sarah motioned to continue the hearing to March 14th at 6:40pm; seconded by Tom; PBPRC voted 5-0-1, motion passed. Isaac abstained.

Public Meeting: CCS Sanctuary – Moshup Trail Map 12 Lot 87 – Special Permit Amendment Request for modification to foundation and increase of full basement – Applicant presented the proposed amendment: originally approved for full basement below the center of the house with crawl spaces below the wings; without a garage, owner was hoping for more basement space for storage; applicant found that the excavation and installation of the foundation would be easier without having stepped footings and different hole heights; with the expansion of the basement, building code requires a second means of egress (excess of 200sf of habitable space in basement because it has appropriate height), and amended plan includes a bulk head off the north side of house; bulkhead would be 38sf of additional footprint; no windows in the basement. Committee determined that the proposed amendment would not change the amount of ground disturbance and would not alter the previously approved building envelope. Con Com will review the request on Feb 21. Isaac motioned to approve subject to Conservation Commission review; Jim M seconded; PBPRC voted 6-0, motion passed.

Public Hearing: Delmont Araujo (Cliff Lot Lessee) - 17 Aquinnah Circle- Map 6 Lot 20.3(continued from 1.3.23) – Applicant presented revised plans with the elimination of expresso bar; observation deck will be

sited along the east side of the structure and measure 4'6"x21'x10' (approx. 190sf); a "costumer counter" will enclose a portion of the deck leaving a 6ft entrance on the back side (entry perpendicular to existing railroad ties). Committee confirmed that the deck lies entirely within the applicants lease lot boundaries. Tom informed the committee that he anticipated the master lease with the Wampanoag Tribe being completed soon and will not alter the current lot size (applicants lease is through the Tribe). Tom motioned to approve the amended project as presented subject to getting the lease finalized; Jim M seconded; PBPRC voted 6-0, motion passed.

Public Hearing: Darren Friedman - off Tar Barrel Road - Map 8 Lot 39 (continued from 1.3.23) – Jim W recused himself. Applicant presented the proposed plans: approximately 6-acre lot; PBPRC approved siting of septic but conditioned approval on review of house siting/design; 5-bedroom septic has been installed; driving constraints of project include a large wetland located to the western side of property (effectively half of property is wetland), wet spots on the east side (not classified as wetlands) and a steep hill; footprint of main house is 3,000sf with 4-bedrooms; proposed garage is 780sf with second floor bedroom (detached bedroom); dwelling height is approximately 28ft above mean grade; given topography of the site, proposed dwelling has a walkout basement and from the north will appear as a 3 story dwelling; driveway will curve up to the garage; dwelling is oriented east-west (95ft from end to end); materials will be natural and/or neutral in color (cedar shingles); certain sections of the dwelling exceed the 50% wall to glass ratio policy.

PBPRC expressed the following concerns: total footprint exceeding the 2,000sf as of right (proposed project is close to 4,000sf); sections of the dwelling that exceed the 50% wall to glass policy; potential visibility from the north shore (PBPRC looked at applicant's vantage point photos and structure is unlikely visible from the beach); siting of a house 28ft high on the highest point of the lot (has the appearance of being on a ridge) which does not concur with zoning (section 13.4-2 Siting Guidelines in Town DCPC); comparison of other structures and effect on neighborhood; potential loss of trees that would in turn effect screening of the structure and cause it to be more stark against the skyline; 95ft long roofline that is not broken up.

Abutters expressed the following comments and concerns: proximity to wet areas on east side of property (abutter has certified site plan delineating spots as wetlands); potential geological issues given topography of lot (wet spots); driveway surface concerns (will be packed gravel or earth and permeable); proposed project goes against bylaws and would be a detractor to the town; proposed dwelling is larger than the other dwellings on Tar Barrel; use of large growth trees for screening and tease out the land that is usable/available. Owner noted that they tried to understand the topography of the lot and have the structure blend in. Owner stated that they are willing to put in more vegetation to decrease visibility.

Committee discussed the order of review between PBPRC and Con Com given the sizable wetland on the property. Sarah noted that the boards need to work together. The following feedback was noted for Con Comm and the applicant: increasing the setback to the wetland; looking at the height; decreasing window glazing; and breaking up the mass/decreasing footprint. With the applicant's agreement, Jim M motioned to continue to March 14th at 6:50pm with a site visit; Tom seconded; PBPRC voted 6-0-1, motion passed; Jim W abstained.

Public Hearing: Kevin Smith - 43 Moshup Trail - Map 12 Lot 11 (continued from 1.3.23) – Applicant presented the proposed project: originally proposed elements of project were revised/modified; siting of 10'x16' was relocated further from wetlands and situated between the driveway and dwelling; shed will be positioned on cement blocks and will not require any digging; proposed second story deck 10ft extension meets all setbacks; deck stairway was relocated outside of the Moshup Trail 150ft setback; deck

extension will require 3 footings and stairway will require 1 footing; proposed patio area, defined as footprint, did not meet the 150ft Moshup Trail setback requirements. Committee did not have the authority to approve the proposed patio. PBPRC did not find any issues with the deck extension or the shed. Jim M motioned to approve the deck as presented with the staircase and the location of the shed; Tom seconded; PBPRC voted 5-0-1, motion passed. Heidi abstained.

Public Meeting: Kenneth and Corrine Dipietro - 5 Sunset Lane - Map 6 Lot 105.2 – Review of landscape as conditioned in Special Permit Amendment dated September 12, 2017 – Applicant presented the as-built landscape plan: approved plans included the siting of two groupings of trees to the west northwest to mitigate views of structure from public points (specifically the Aquinnah Circle/Cliffs); as project went forward, there was a lot less grading done (meadow area) and vegetation that remained. Committee found that the western side of the structure still needs screening, which the approved plantings would have accomplished. Combination of master bedroom and west facing wall and where the chimney façade is located could be broken up more with vegetation. Applicant understood the concerns expressed by the committee. Applicant and committee agreed that a final review of plantings should be done at the end of the growing season. Jim M motioned to do the plantings as previously approved; Tom seconded; PBPRC voted 6-0, motion passed.

With no other business, the meeting adjourned at 8:18pm.

Respectfully submitted, Sophia Welch, Board Administrative Assistant